



**INTERNAL AUDITOR'S  
REVIEW REPORT OF THE  
HUMAN RESOURCES  
APPLICATION PROCESS**

**JUNE 4, 2019**

**Ernest Harvin, CIA  
Internal Audit Function  
Doña Ana County**

**Doña Ana County Internal Audit  
Human Resources Application Process – Review**

**Table of Contents**

<b>LETTER TO COUNTY MANAGER</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>INTERVIEWS</b>	<b>4</b>
<b>TESTING</b>	<b>5</b>
<b>CONCLUSION</b>	<b>6</b>

June 4, 2019

Honorable County Manager,

Concerns have been raised from applicants about their application submissions, as some believe their applications did not receive due consideration. Herein, questions and criticisms were raised that appear to target the County's application system (*iCIMS*), as applicants claim to have submitted completed applications which the application system failed to acknowledge as either completed or submitted.

In seeking assurance concerning the integrity of both the *iCIMS* and the Human Resources application assessment process, I reviewed the Human Resources application process, and also tested the application system with applications submitted by one applicant (hereinafter referred to as the applicant) in particular, who had applied for at least three positions over the past three years. The review included interviewing the applicant, meeting with Human Resources (HR) personnel involved in the application assessment process, and making an analysis of actions taken in reference to the three applications submitted. In addition, I submitted applications of my own to test the system's responsiveness.

### **Management's Responsibility**

Human Resources is responsible for providing a comprehensive Human Resources program with an emphasis on proactive, solutions oriented service to all County community members including current, prospective and former employees. Amongst its core functions are

- Recruitment, screening and selection
- Policy development, interpretation and compliance
- Employment law compliance (Federal and State)
- Maintenance of applicant and employee records

### **Internal Auditor's Responsibility**

The internal auditor is responsible for conducting the review engagement in accordance with Statements on Standards for Accounting and Review Services. This review is substantially less in scope than an audit, as the focus was upon the application procedures for only one applicant, for the past 3-year period (the length of time HR is required to maintain applications). Thus, this review does not provide assurance that the internal auditor would become aware of all significant matters as would be disclosed in a full audit engagement.

## Scope

A review is substantially less in scope than an audit, the objective of which is the expression of an opinion regarding an organization's financial statements as a whole. This review includes primarily applying analytical procedures to Human Resources' data and making inquiries of Human Resources personnel. The applications specifically referred to in the following section of this review were those of only one applicant.

## Interviews

For the past 3-year period, the applicant submitted applications for the following positions -

- Accounting Specialist, Treasurer in 2017 (Treasurer's Office)
- Utilities Customer Service Lead in January 2019 (CRRUA)
- Utilities Customer Service Clerk in January 2019 (CRRUA)  
Camino Real Regional Utility Authority (CRRUA)

### *Accounting Specialist, Treasurer*

As a result of applying for this position, the applicant purports to have been informed via email that the application had been incomplete, which disqualified the applicant.

However, a review of the application results with HR indicates that the applicant did not meet the minimum qualifications for the job (Job 2017-2290), as the education and/or experience was lacking.

While viewing the application for this position, the internal auditor requested that the Training Coordinator/Senior HR Administrator and the HR Representative perform a verbal, impromptu analysis (grading) of the application submitted as it pertained to the job description (qualifications). Herein, the HR Representatives took the internal auditor through a comprehensive analysis, comparing the application data submitted, to the required credentials listed in the job description. The job description stated that two years of full-time accounting bookkeeping experience was required. While the application indicated years of customer service experience, accounting duties listed were peripheral to full-time accounting functions.

This review confirmed HR's analysis that the application did not meet the job requirements.

**NOTE:** The applicant no longer had the email to corroborate an account of the results for this application.

### *Utilities Customer Service Lead*

As a result of applying for this position, the applicant was informed via email that, "*the education and/or work experience areas of your application were left blank or not filled*

*out correctly or you did not not [sic] submit the required license or certification.”* In this particular case, the applicant provided screenshots of the completed application as proof that all boxes were filled in.

While the results from HR supported that a completed application was submitted, it also indicated that the applicant checked a box on the application in error, stating that the applicant did not have a High School Diploma. This disqualified the applicant for the position. Conversely, within the application it is stated that the applicant indeed has a High School Diploma.

This review confirmed that the error committed by the applicant resulted in a disqualification for this application, as the information submitted was contradictory.

**NOTE:** The applicant forwarded an email to corroborate an account of the results for this application.

#### *Utilities Customer Service Clerk (CRRUA)*

As a result of applying for this position, the applicant was informed via email that, “*You have been determined through an assessment completed by our office to have met the minimum qualifications for the position of CRRUA- Utility Customer Service Clerk. As such you have been forwarded to the Camino Real Regional Utility Authority Department for their review. They will be contacting applicants that they would like to interview.*”

Thus, the applicant’s credentials were passed on to the hiring manager.

This review confirmed that the application was completed and submitted, matching both the applicant’s and HR’s account of events.

**NOTE:** The applicant forwarded an email to corroborate an account of the results for this application.

#### **Testing**

Having investigated the accounts of both the applicant and the HR Reviewers, the internal auditor tested the *iCIMS* to confirm proper functionality. I submitted a completed application, an incomplete application, and submitted and withdrew an application. As explained by the Training Coordinator/Senior HR Administrator and the HR Representative, the *iCIMS* acknowledged via email, each position for which I had applied. The *iCIMS* remitted an email reminder concerning the incomplete application, 48-hours after I begun the application process. The *iCIMS* kept a record of all applications, indicating that one was withdrawn, one was incomplete, and one was submitted, accepted, and forwarded to the hiring manager for further consideration.

## Conclusion

In response to concerns about Doña Ana County's application process, the internal auditor (1) reviewed the Human Resources Policies & Procedures, (2) interviewed the applicant to learn about concerns, (3) interviewed HR Personnel about the application system and process, as well as the applicant's applications, and (4) applied for positions, noting system functionality.

I found that the current policy is easily understood and adequately describes the hiring process. Applications submitted by the applicant were given proper consideration, per the policy in effect. The *iCIMS* responded as intended to applications completed and submitted, submitted and withdrawn, and to those that remained incomplete. In addition, the County Manager's Directive for HR to take the additional measure of contacting applicants who appear to be qualified yet submit incomplete applications, addresses the possible disqualifying of applicants who may have fallen short in their due diligence to ensure that applications are complete.

Based on my review, I am not aware of any material modifications that should be made to the current Human Resources application assessment process to bring it into conformity with current policies and procedures. Specifically, I found no incidents of policy or procedural nonconformity, as it pertains to applications submitted by the applicant.



Ernest Harvin, CIA

Internal Auditor – Doña Ana County

13 November 2023

Date